

REPORT: FOLLOW UP MONITORING AND INSPECTION VISIT
TONGOGARA REFUGEE CAMP
DATES: 18 - 21 FEBRUARY 2019



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Zimbabwe Human Rights Commission (ZHRC)'s functions are set out in Section 243 of the Constitution of Zimbabwe (Amendment No. 20) Act 2013. Specifically, Section 243(1)(k)(i) of the Constitution, bestows the ZHRC the responsibility to visit and inspect prisons, places of detention, refugee camps and related facilities. In fulfillment of the mandate, the ZHRC monitored and inspected Tongogara Refugee Camp, in Chipinge District, Manicaland Province in August 2017. A human rights situation report was compiled and shared with all key stakeholders involved in the protection and care of refugees at the camp. Specific recommendations were also made to relevant government ministries and stakeholders. To further track implementation of recommendations made after the August 2017 visit, the ZHRC conducted a follow up monitoring visit to Tongogara Refugee Camp from 18 to 21 February 2019.

The mission sought to strengthen the enjoyment of human rights by refugees and asylum seekers through tracking implementation of recommendations made in 2017 and also to document emerging human rights issues within the camp. The follow up monitoring visit assessed implementation of recommendations made in 2017 and also further assessed the enjoyment of rights and freedoms by the refugees which amongst others included the rights to health, education, and the right to work. The ZHRC noted that most of the 2017 monitoring visit recommendations were at various stages of implementation, towards improving the enjoyment of human rights by refugees. Notably, great strides had been made in the provision of education and health services amongst others. However, resource constraints remain a challenge for full implementation of the recommendations exacerbated by the fact that the refugee camp is a fast growing community due to an estimated 150 new arrivals every month.

Furthermore, new human rights concerns were noted during the follow up visit. These include the need to attend to camp staff welfare issues, the need to bring to finality the determination of cessation of Rwandese within the camp, the need to decongest the reception area that is now overcrowded, the need to come up with vocational training programmes, and the need to strengthen and improve social protection service provision within the camp.

1. INTRODUCTION

The monitoring mission was conducted on the 19th and 20th of February 2019 in and around Tongogara Refugee Camp. The ZHRC delegation was led by Commissioner Sheila Matindike (who is the Chairperson of the Special Interest Groups Thematic Working Group), and further comprised of the Head of Programmes, three Human Rights Officers and the Public Relations Officer.

The follow-up monitoring programme included engagement with the Camp Administrator from the Department of Social Services (DSS) in the Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare and key stakeholders/ Partners who work with Refugees, focus group discussions with camp leaders representing different nationals and tours to camp sites like health facilities, education facilities and livelihoods projects. The team also interacted with other established partners who work with refugees and these included the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR), Goal Zimbabwe and Terre Des Hommes (TDH).

In the engagement and feedback meeting with the stakeholders, the ZHRC Head of Programmes highlighted the dual mandate, role and functions of the ZHRC as enshrined in the Constitution of Zimbabwe. He especially emphasized the ZHRC mandate to monitor human rights situations including in refugee camps and the independent role of the Commission in its operations.

Current Statistics

The Camp Administrator informed the ZHRC that the total population of refugees and asylum seekers at Tongogara Refugee Camp increased from eleven thousand and eighty-one (11,081) in 2017 to a new high of twelve thousand four hundred and eighteen (12,481) in February 2019 as shown below.

Table 1. Legal status

Count of individual ID	Female	Male	Grand Total
Asylum seekers	1,899	2,138	4,037
***Not of Concern	358	390	748
Other of Concern	49	50	99
Refugee	3,494	4,040	7,534
Grand Total	5,800	6,618	12,418

1

The majority of the population in the camp were those from the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC)(9,834 people), followed by Mozambique(1,437people), Burundi (843 people) and Rwanda (804 people). The increased influx of asylum seekers between 2017 and February 2019 had increased pressure on resources allocation in the camp. The Camp Administrator also presented the state of rejected asylum seekers (Not of Concern on table 1`) which he noted to be on the increase and its implication on human rights enjoyment and resource allocations. Of concern to the ZHRC were persons not of concern's lack of access to identity documents and the implications. An exit meeting with the key stakeholders at the camp concluded the follow up monitoring visit with the aim to receive clarity on certain issues raised by the inhabitants and mapping a way forward.

^{1 11} **Not of Concern** are persons who have an official asylum status as rejected on two appeals, which is the first instance rejection and the final instance rejection official making them not of concern. These decisions are both from the government of Zimbabwe(GoZ) Refugee Status determination committees and UNHCR. These persons however despite the status" Not of concern" are still living in Zimbabwe and receiving assistance from UNHCR while awaiting a solution which is being negotiated with the GoZ and UNHCR.

Asylum seekers are persons who have or are still undergoing the refugee status determination process and have either not yet gone through the RSD interviews or have been rejected on first instance and await for a chance to appeal to the Commissioner for Refugees to overturn the first instance decision.

Others of Concern. In principle should be all Zimbabweans who are spouses and children to refugees and asylum seekers, however at times parents prefer to register their children with the father's nationality as a culture, which in future makes it difficult to naturalize the children's nationality as the host parent

2. OBJECTIVES OF THE VISIT

- 2.1. To track progress on the implementation of the recommendations made by the ZHRC following the first monitoring visit in August 2017.
- 2.2. To monitor and assess the enjoyment of human rights and freedoms by refugees at Tongogara Refugee Camp
- 2.3. To note and document other emerging human rights issues in the camp.
- 2.4. To increase ZHRC visibility in monitoring places of detention and in particular reference, refugee camps.

3. METHODOLOGY

The ZHRC, in carrying out the two-day monitoring visit used tools such as; key informant interviews, focus group discussions and monitors' observations in gathering information to ascertain the human rights situation of the persons of concern at the camp.

3.1. Key Informant Interviews were conducted with officials including; the Refugee Camp Administrator, Programme Coordinator for UNHCR, Programme Manager for Goal Zimbabwe, Programme Manager for Terre Des Hommes, nurses and teachers. The aim of the interviews was to gain insight of the work undertaken at the camp, challenges faced and recommendations towards addressing the issues raised.

3.2. Focus Group Discussions were held with Camp leaders of Tongogara refugee camp. The Camp leaders represented nationals living in the camp, the elderly, widowed and single mothers and the churches. The aim of these discussions was to have an appraisal of the human rights situation since the August 2017 visit. The focus group discussions were participatory in nature. Participants were given an opportunity to reflect on how they viewed their living conditions and areas that needed improvement and rectification.

3.3. Observation by the monitoring team related to assessing and observing the environment. The team gained understanding of the geographical location, land size, types of housing, water supply and sanitation, health, education and recreational facilities utilized by the populace of the refugee camp.

4. LEGAL FRAMEWORK

The following national law is relevant to the issues affecting refugees and asylum seekers.

4.2. Refugee Act Chapter 4:03 Act 13/1983/ 22/2001

4.3. International and Regional Human Rights Instruments

4.3.1. United Nations Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951

4.3.2. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966

4.3.3. International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights, 1966

4.3.4. Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1990

4.3.5. African Union Convention Governing the Specific Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa, 1969

4.3.6. African Charter on Human and People's Rights, 1986

5. FINDINGS FROM THE FOLLOW UP MONITORING MISSION

5.1. Feedback on Recommendations Implementation

Previous Recommendations to relevant ministry or department (2017)	Findings on the follow Up (2019)	ZHRC Comments
Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare		
The Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare through the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Human Rights and Humanitarian Law should consider setting in motion, the revocation of the reservations to the 1951 Refugee Convention to enhance the enjoyment of rights by all refugees.	No movement on the subject	The ZHRC should start the process of engaging the ministry to facilitate revocation of the reservation to the 1951 Refugee Convention to enhance the enjoyment of rights by all refugee

The Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare should align the Refugee Act [Chapter 4:03] to the Constitution and international standards on the rights of refugees.	The ministry is seized with processes to align the Refugee Act (Chapter 4:03) to the Constitution	There is need to continue pushing for realignment process including the realignment of the Refugee Act (Chapter 4:03) to the Constitution.
As read with recommendation 7.1., the Ministry should actively promote the right to work amongst refugees so that the burden of taking care of the refugees is removed from the state.	Discussion have started and the position at the moment is that refugees can work on areas where there are scarce skills. For example, there are some refugees being employed at Africa University and Mutare Hospital. However, the number remains a drop in the ocean. Right to work also being augmented through self-reliance projects e.g. soap making and irrigation projects	There is need to continue empowering refugees to increase numbers being employed both in the formal and informal sector.
The Ministry of Public Service , Labour and Social Welfare in partnership with other organisations should conduct awareness raising for refugees and asylum seekers on their rights and status determination.	The Camp administrator reported that awareness raising activities were estimated to be at about 30% of the ideal. These were being implemented through camp leadership structures. ZHRC was invited to augment camp human rights awareness activities	The ZHRC to line up human rights awareness activities within Tongogara Refugee Camp
The Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare should advocate for the increase of the monthly disbursement of \$13 which is too little considering the cost of living in Zimbabwe and	There is no movement or review of the monthly public social protection allowance that is still pegged at US\$13.00. There were reports of outcry by refugee on inconsistency and unpredictability in the monthly	There was urgent need to advocate for consistency and predictable social protection distribution by

also ensure that there is provision of supplementary food items	distribution of social protection allowances	TDH and World Food Programme
The Zimbabwe Refugee Committee should complete status determination within a reasonable time and within the provisions of the Refugee Act to avoid lengthy periods of uncertainty for those seeking refugee status.	The Zimbabwe Refugee Committee was engaged to expedite status determination. The ZRC has put in place a calendar of monthly sessions for status determination. The aim being to clear the backlog of determining the status of refugees	The new arrangement is commendable as the new systematic sessions will help clear the status determination backlog.
The Ministry should in partnership with development partners improve the provision of basic services such as access to clean water and construction of more toilets so as not to infringe on the human dignity of the refugees.	The camp administrator reported that more boreholes were drilled since 2017. On the day of the monitoring visit, it was reported that 11 boreholes were in use and taped water was being provided in all the sections. Power outages were reported to be impacting on water supply in section 5 and 6. On sanitation issues, it was reported that there was a blitz on construction of toilets and there was 95% access to sanitation	Progress in the provision of water and sanitation is commendable and efforts should be intensified.
Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education		
The Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education and partners such as Save the Children and Terres de Hommes should construct another ECD block to accommodate all the children resident at Tongogara Refugee Camp.	Two more ECD classrooms were completed thus accommodating more children. Total enrollment stood at 639 children. Although more teachers were initially deployed towards end of 2018, they were later transferred to the primary school, thus leaving the figures at 3 teachers and 10 para profession teachers	There is need to continue engaging the Provincial Education Officer to increase the number of ECD teachers.

The Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education should recruit more Primary School teachers, ensuring that the pupils at the School receive quality basic standard of education.	It was reported that engagement with Ministry were progressing well.	Continued follow up required
The Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education should construct an A 'Level block at the Secondary School, provide it with qualified teachers, furniture and equipment in order for pupils to be able to complete their secondary studies at the camp.	The camp administrator reported that a new classroom block has been completed but more needs to be done. A science laboratory was also under construction. However, St Michael Secondary School still needs to attain independent status since currently it is a satellite of Chipangayi High School and this affect granting of "A" level status.	Efforts to be increased to facilitate granting of independent status to St Michael Secondary School to enable granting of "A' level status.
Ministry Of Health and Child Care		
The Ministry of Health and Child Care is urged to appoint a resident medical doctor at the camp.	It was reported that the arrangement of a visiting doctor on Thursdays still persists. However, the Camp Administrator advised that they have increased the number of visits by different health specialists. Two reliable ambulances were also on standby. The requirement for a resident doctor was not implementable since rural health centres do not have resident doctors. This will mean upgrading to a hospital and will involve major infrastructural constructions e.g. theatre, laboratories, pharmacy and more. All the same progress had been made in	Since the clinic is a Primary Health Centre, the available infrastructure is relatively adequate to cater for the needs of the population

	sprucing up existing infrastructure and establishing the maternity wing.	
The Ministry of Health and Child Care should expand the infrastructure of the medical centre at the camp in order to accommodate the performance of surgeries, particularly in emergency situations.	It was reported that infrastructural improvements were underway including refurbishment of small laboratory, paintings have been done in most clinic rooms. However the clinic remain a Primary Health Centre and the available infrastructure should be adequate to meet the demands of the population within the camp.	The Ministry of Healthy and Child care is commended for the work achieved in refurbishment of the infrastructure at the camp.
Ministry of Home Affairs and Cultural Heritage		
The Ministry of Home Affairs, through the Zimbabwe Republic Police (ZRP) should establish a police post within the camp to increase public order and curb crime.	Considerable progress has been made in the construction of infrastructure to enable the setting out of a police post within the camp. There was a budgetary allocation for infrastructural improvement in preparation of transformation of the ZPS police base into a police post. Accommodation has been constructed, a charge office is also now complete. It is now up to the Zimbabwe Police Service to change the set up from a police base to a police post that deploys more personnel. It was reported that the current 3 ZPS personnel was being overwhelmed by demand for their service by both the hosting community and the population in the Refugee Camp.	There is need for concerted follow up with the Ministry of Home Affairs and Cultural Heritage to expedite the setting up of a police post that will increase security of both camp staff and the camp population.

Ministry of Environment, Water and Climate		
The Ministry of Environment, Water and Climate should consider the construction of a perimeter fence of the Save Conservancy and perimeter lighting to enhance security of refugees from animals that encroach.	The need for a perimeter fence between Save Conservancy and the Tongogara Refugee Camp had been taken up with the Zimbabwe Refugee Committee who indicated that they were engaging with the Parks and Wildlife Department. It was also reported that lighting in the camp was being improved following the securing of funding from African Development Bank	The ZHRC and other stakeholders to continue pushing for the establishment of the perimeter fence that separates the camp and the Save Conservancy

5.2. Emerging Human Rights Concerns

5.2.1. Need for Human Rights Awareness Session for Populations at Tongogara Refugee Camp

The refugees requested workshops and outreaches to increase awareness on their rights, duties and obligations under national, regional and international law. They were of the opinion that this would help them to be model citizens in the host country. It would also assist in them knowing how their rights could be protected.

5.2.2. Right to Shelter and Overcrowding at the Camp Reception Centre

The Camp Administrator reported that the Reception Centre was overcrowded with all the rooms there housing (5) persons each. The rooms were small to cater for 5 people thus exposing the inhabitants to overcrowding and diseases in the event of an outbreak. The shortage of accommodation has resulted in other people received at the reception centre staying in the open places including in times of adverse weather. Other families have stayed at the reception centre for over 4 months due to accommodation shortages. Water supply challenges were also reported at the reception centre. There is need for more resources to construct houses and decongest the reception centre. The ZHRC was informed of the establishment of Section 9 as a measure to decongest the reception centre. However, more resources are needed for the construction of houses and ablution facilities.

5.2.3. Need for Improved Security Arrangements at the Camp.

Camp leaders requested the establishment of a Zimbabwe Police Services Post within the refugee camp. The high number of refugees at the camp increase crime rate. During discussions with camp leaders, concerns were raised that some refugees were intimidating other refugees within the camp. It was also stated that the presence of a police post would assist in the reduction of crime and also as a deterrent to would be offenders.

The residents were also concerned that wild animals sometimes strayed into the camp from the Save Valley Conservancy. There is need to fence off the Conservancy so that the refugees would be protected and increase sense of security. The ZHRC also recommends lighting around the camp which would help deter the animals from breaking into the encampment.

5.2.4. Inconsistence and unpredictable social protection allowance distributions

The ZHRC was informed that Refugees continued to receive cash disbursements of \$USD13 social protection monthly allowance. These payments continue to be supported by the WFP, UNHCR and TDH. The provision of social protection allowances is in conformity with Article 9 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights which places a responsibility on States to recognize the right of everyone to social security. Therefore, the efforts of Government and supporting partners working at the camp was indicative of Zimbabwe's commitment in upholding its international obligations.

A meeting with camp leaders, however revealed that social protection allowance distribution was erratic, not fixed and unpredictable hence causing challenges of budgeting. The practice is against the minimum standards on social security provision that require such programmes to be consistent and predictable. The situation is worsened by the meagre monthly disbursement, considering that the monthly allowance is pegged at \$13 per each qualifying candidate. The allowances for January 2019 were only distributed in the second week of February 2019. Failure to adhere to timely distribution of social protection allowances lead to exposure of vulnerable

groups such as widows and single mothers, were exposed to sexual exploitation and prostitution.

Engagement with the United Nations High Commission for Refugees representatives indicated that inconsistency in social protection allowance distribution was caused by limited donor response to the pooling for the resources for allowances. The ZHRC and other partners were requested to lobby for more resources for refugees.

5.2.5. Right to education and vocational skills training for the youths in the Camp



Figs 2. Showing ECD Infrastructure at Tongogara Refugee Camp.

Provision of Early Childhood Development services improved greatly since 2017 and the ZHRC commends all efforts being made by the camp administration. Two more ECD classrooms were completed thus accommodating more children. The ZHRC team was informed that by February 2019, ECD total enrollment stood at 639 children.

Although more teachers were initially deployed towards end of 2018, they were later transferred to the primary school, thus leaving the figures at 3 teachers and 10 para profession teachers

On secondary school education, the Camp administrator indicated that challenges related to the provision of “A” Level studies at the secondary school persist. These challenges impeded the pupils from fully enjoying the right to education and further contravened the provisions of Article 22 (1) of the 1951 Refugee Convention which recognizes that states shall accord refugees the same treatment in education accorded to nationals. Furthermore, only 10 scholarships are accessible through the DUF Scholarships thus exposing the rest of the youths to redundancy as they cannot progress with tertiary education. At the time of the visit a Science Laboratory, which is a requirement for being awarded an A’ level status, was still under construction.



Figure 3 Science Laboratory under construction at the Secondary School

It was also highlighted that the situation is further compounded by the lack of vocational training skills within the camp. Consequently, youths were prone to teenage misdemeanors like alcohol abuse, unwanted pregnancies and prostitution. More

partners should be invited to fill in the gap of scholarship and vocational skills training opportunities.

5.2.6. Unaccompanied Refugee Children

The Camp Administrator indicated that they continue to receive unaccompanied children from the Democratic Republic of Congo especially those in the 12-17 age group. He further reported that the Department of Social Welfare and TDH employ community based approaches to the care of unaccompanied children. However, refugee volunteers were few and some unaccompanied children stay alone at the centre. More proactive approaches should be streamlined in the reception of unaccompanied refugee children.

5.2.7. Determination of Cessation for Rwandese Refugees.

The ZHRC was briefed on the outstanding determination of cessation of Rwandese Refugees. The Rwandese were given several deadlines to return to their country as it was considered safe by the UN agencies and the global community in general. The latest deadline was June 2018, but they have been refusing to go back home insisting that it was not safe to do so. They have appealed to His Excellency, President Emerson Dambudzo Mnangagwa refusing to return to their country and there has not been movement of the issue since June 2018. The Rwandese argue that reports by their representatives who went on a “Go and See, Come and Tell Back” Mission were negative thus they were not willing to return to Rwanda. Engagement with the UNHCR indicated that it’s a complicated issue and uncertainties remain high on the refugees. It was reported that, in Zambia, the government had embarked on a massive resettlement programme to accommodate the Rwandese. The ZHRC and other stakeholders were requested to assist in bringing the issue to finality.

5.2.8. Persons Not of Concern and Access to Documentation.

The number of Persons Not of Concern stood at seven hundred and forty-eight (748) with 358 being females and 390 being males. These were people whose application for refugee status had been rejected. It was reported that upon rejection applicants are entitled to appeal to the Zimbabwe Refugee Committee within the recommended period. On expiry of the window period for appeal, all rejected applicants are supposed to return to their countries of origin within a month. However, at Tongogara Refugee Camp, some rejected applicants have been accommodated on humanitarian grounds

for the past 5 -10 years in compliance to United Nations Refugee Convention of 1951, Section 83 that provides for non-forceful repatriation. The same issue was also raised in relation to persons of concern that were re-repatriated from Botswana who need intervention so that they are positively readmitted into the camp. The challenge of having so many persons not of concern is access to national identity documents which becomes a big challenge and the ZHRC will need to do more research around these circumstances.

5.2.9. Health and Health Services

According to Article 16 (2) of the African Charter on Human and People's Rights, "States parties shall take the necessary measures to protect the health of their people and to ensure that they receive medical attention when they are sick". Article 24 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, particularly in relation to children, provides that they should be entitled to the right to good quality health care and the best health care possible. The ZHRC monitors noted improvements on the established clinic at Tongogara Refugee Camp. Renovations were made including paintings to the drug storerooms and maternity wings

The Nurse in Charge reported that there were slight changes on staff compliment since the ZHRC visit of 2017. There were 2 additional Nurses and one Environment Health Technician to make a total of (5) nurses and one EHT, three (3) nurse aides and community health workers. The Nurse patient ratio was reported to be 1-200 per day against the recommended 1-50 per day. The Nurse –Patient ratio is still too high and constrains the few health staff members serving the camp. The drug situation was reported to be very good with most drugs in supply through funding from UNHCR and government donations.

Since 2017, the situation had not changed much in terms of the provision of specialist services in that the clinic still depends on visiting personnel from the district hospital in Chipinge. However, the Ministry of Health and Child Care increased scheduled visits to the clinic by all specialists to increase access to high quality health services by the refugees. Two ambulances are always ready for referrals to Chipinge District Hospital and Mutare General Hospital. During the tour of the clinic, ZHRC monitors were

informed that it was very difficult to have resident specialists like Doctors, Pharmacist, Radiographers and Physiotherapist since the infrastructure at the clinic falls short of the requirement to retain such staff.

Camp leaders requested the availability of more staff at the clinic since it was always difficult to be attended for health needs during the night. They also raised the need for the provision of sanitary wear to women and girls consistently. The current situation is that sanitary wear (Cotton wool) is provided after lengthy periods of up to three months.



Fig 3: Shows stocks of drugs at the clinic.

5.2.10 Decongesting the refugee camp and resettlement of long term refugees

The ZHRC was informed of government efforts to decongest the refugee camp. The government continue to prefer voluntary repatriation which is stipulated in Article 5 (2) of the 1969 AU Convention that the “country of asylum, in collaboration with the country of origin, shall make adequate arrangements for the safe return of refugees who request repatriation”. However, that preference is facing stiff resistance from the Rwandese who continue to argue that the conditions are still unsafe for them to return to Rwanda.

The Administrator of the camp highlighted that Zimbabwe is also pursuing the third durable solution that relates to resettlement of refugees to outside countries. It involves permanent relocation of refugees from the camp to countries which include amongst

others; America, Canada, Australia and New Zealand. To that end, in 2018, 650 refugees were interviewed by different representatives of the western world for possible resettlement. The same figure of 650 refugees is targeted for 2019. However, the Camp Administrator and UNHCR representatives indicated that the processes were taking too long to conclude resulting in few successful resettlement cases in the past three years.

5.2.11. Linguistic Human Rights at Tongogara Refugee Camp

Language rights need protection because language is a mirror of one's cultural identity, a vehicle of culture, source of power, mobility and opportunities. It is important to note that the protection of language rights recognizes, affirms and accommodates linguistic diversity. Unfortunately, camp leaders representing Mozambicans bemoaned the use of English as the official language with translations into Swahili and French only. This created a communication barrier for them as there was no translation into Portuguese and their local home language. The paradox was that their mother languages were mainly Shona and Ndau just like the host community but because the officials only used English at events like the International Refugees day meant that they failed to follow the proceedings or understand the key messages being delivered. They lamented the absence of translators and said in most cases “tinozongonzwa kuti chirongwa chapera vanhu vakuenda kunodya” meaning in most cases they only realise that the event has ended when people stand up to go for food. The ZHRC urges the Camp Administration to ensure that translation from official languages to all languages is done during camp activities.

5.3. Staff Welfare Issues

A number of staff welfare issues were raised and also observed during the monitoring visit to the camp. Chief amongst them is the need to provide adequate and secure accommodation for staff. Currently 6 Officers share a block house with six rooms and there are two such blocks of houses. The houses were in a state of disrepair and not suitable for habitation for the staff members and their families.

Additionally, the current set up where staff accommodation is located within the refugee camp residential quarters is not safe and secure. The camp staff narrated an incident in which one of the staff members was abducted and held hostage during a

refugee riot in 2017. Related to that is the need to beef up security for staff at the camp through the deployment of more ZPS staff and turning the police base into a police post.

Both camp administration and health staff indicated huge workloads for example the nurse: patient ratio of 1-200 was too high. They generally worked long hours every day to attend to situations requiring urgent attention. Motivational allowances in the form of hardship allowance will go a long way to address the situation.



Fig 4: One of the staff quarters at the camp

6. CONCLUSION

The ZHRC took note of the efforts being made by government and other partners in addressing the recommendations made after the ZHRC 2017 monitoring visit. The follow up monitoring mission noted that most of the recommendations are at different stages of being addressed. This is commendable as it further strengthen the enjoyment of human rights by refugees and asylum seekers. Thus the two groups were being accorded the same treatment as nationals regarding issues of education, health services, right to work, and freedom of movement as stipulated in regional and international treaties that Zimbabwe has ratified. However, the ZHRC continues to recommend the full implementation of the recommendations made in 2017 and also

those related to emerging issues noted during the 2019 monitoring visit. The determination for cessation of Rwandese refugee needs finalization

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1. Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare

7.1.1. The Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare is recommended to deal decisively with cessation of determination for the Rwandese Refugees

7.1.2. It is recommended that the Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare ensure that social protection allowances are distributed in predictable and consistent manner to reduce exposure of women, widows and single mothers.

7.1.3. It is recommended that the Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare continues lobbying for more budgetary support from government in order to increase social protection allowances for refugees

7.1.4. The Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare must consider construction of secure and convenient staff quarters outside the Camp premises. This should receive urgent attention given the health and security hazards that the staff members are currently exposed to.

7.1.5. The Ministry must increase personnel at the camp to reduce burn outs. Introduction of motivational incentives will also assist in improving morale for staff.

7.2. Ministry of Health and Child Care

7.2.1. It is recommended that the Ministry of Health and Child Care increase health personnel at the Camp Clinic to reduce overworking the nurses. The reported nurse to patient ration of 1-200 per day is too much.

7.2.2. The Ministry is further urged to facilitate the employment of a fulltime pharmacist at the clinic since storage facilities have been renovated and all drugs are available.

7.3. Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education

7.3.1. The Ministry must facilitate more scholarships for youths in the camp to increase access to education.

7.3.2. The ZHRC further recommend the Ministry to increase provision of vocational training skills for youths within the camp structures.

7.3.3. The Ministry is recommended to facilitate the attainment of “A” level status for St Michael Secondary School to alleviate challenges being faced in securing “A” level places for children from the camp.

7.4. Ministry of Home Affairs and Cultural Heritage

7.4.1 The ZHRC recommends that the Ministry expedites the transformation of Tongogara Refugee Camp Police Base into a Police Post to increase security within the Camp.

7.5. Ministry of Environment, Tourism and Hospitality Industry.

7.5.1. The Department of Parks and Wildlife Management must facilitate the erection of a fence between Save Conservancy and Tongogara Refugee Camp to increase security of camp residents.

8. ZHRC Tongogara Refugee Camp Monitoring in Pictures.



Figure 6. Group photo with staff members at the ECD Centre



Figure 7 Focus Group Discussion with Camp Leaders



Figure 8 Toilets constructed in the New Section 9